

Developing A Counter-Narrative To Hate Speech With Special Reference To Pakistan

Anila Bibi¹, Dr. Sami ul Haq², Kosar Bibi³

¹ Lecturer, Department of Islamic and Religious Studies, University of Haripur, Haripur, Pakistan

² Assistant Professor, Department of Islamiyat, Shaheed Benazir Bhutto University, Sheringal, Dir, Pakistan

³ PhD Scholar, Department of Islamic and Religious Studies, University of Haripur, Haripur, Pakistan

Abstract:

This study elaborates on the role of Narrative and counter Narrative in the modern-day world. The world has seen various hate narratives based on violent extremist ideologies. This research examines various mindsets and thinks tanks working behind such narratives. The study particularly covers different kinds of hate narratives prevailing in Pakistani society. The research also brings to light the means and methods to develop a counter-narrative with special reference to the relevant issues faced by Pakistani society. The research highlights the role and significance of a counter-narrative in the uplifting and development of a society based on durable and sustainable peace.

Keywords: Narrative, Counter narrative, Hate Speech, Pakistani society.

Introduction

Narratives have always contributed to achieving different objectives. Gone are those days when only Media enabled people to express their stories, their cultural values, and their knowledge to the world. In the modern world, narratives are used for broader purposes. Research has proven in recent times that a vast number of people have observed extreme changes in their attitudes and views. In the modern-day world, one hears narratives, talks about narratives, and peruses and banter narratives, love, and disdain narratives. One is fettered by narratives. It is a method to occupy territory and influence others as it is the age of controlling thoughts and minds (Eerten et al. 2017)

Objectives of Study

- To analyze the background and conditions in which hate narratives were developed.
- To study the reasons behind the absence of a strong counter-narrative.

Research Questions

- What is Narrative and why is it very important in the Modern world?
- How is Hate Narrative developed?
- Which possible means and methods are useful to develop an effective Narrative for peace?

Research Methodology

The present research work is a qualitative and descriptive methodology

Literature Review

The Impact of Counter Narrative, Religio, Violence and Conflict Resolution by Marc Gopin.
Handbook of Peace and Conflict Studies edited by Charles Webb, Johan Galtung.
Confronting War: Critical Lessons for Peace, Violence, Terrorism and Teaching of Islam by Dr.M.Imtiaz.
Holy War in ancient Israel by Gerhard vonrad
War, Peace and Christianity by J.Daryl Charles, Timothy J.Demy.
War and Peace in the ancient World by Kurt A.Raaflaub.
The Ethics of War and Peace by Terry Nardin
War and Peace in the Jewish tradition by Lawrence Schiffman, Joel B.Wolowelsky.
Islām Dehshat Gardi yā ‘ālmī bhāi Chārā by Dr. zākir Nā'ik
Yahūd ō Nṣārā Tārykh ky Āiyyniy Myṇ by imām Ibn al-Qayyim Āl-Jawzi
Āqūām-i-‘ālam kē ādyān -o-Mazāhib by 'Abd al Qādir Shaybā Al-Hamd
Maghrib awr ālam-e-Islām by Khurram Murād
Yahudiyat ‘Eysā’iyat owr Islām by Shaykh Āhmad Didāt
Yahudiyat Qurān ki Rawshani men by Sayyid Ābū Āl A'lā Mawdidī
In the modern world especially in Pakistani society, there is a dire need to address such issues to sustain peace which is necessary for Pakistani society and needs time.

NARRATIVE

A narrative is a story or a report of connected events, events are presented in sequence. Sometimes these events are related to real life and sometimes these are imaginary events, sometimes in written form and sometimes in spoken words. It is some kind of retelling, in words of something that happens, a report of different events related to each other that are presented to listeners. Before explaining the importance of narrative it is important to discuss and clarify a few definitions of the word narrative. **Narrative** in the English language comes from the Latin "Narratio" or "Narrationis" as is additionally the situation for other Latin-affected dialects, for example, Spanish "narrativa" or Romanian "narativ". The narrative shows up in these language word references as a fairly formal term for a story or to allude to scholarly types, for example, books or writing. To describe is to recount a story, to give a record of occasions or encounters, regardless of whether valid or anecdotal (Eerten et al. 2017). **The narrative** is a particular way of explaining (Lehtinen 2020). **Narrative** "can be considered as the story or enrollment pitch of fierce fanatics (Leuprecht et al. 2010). According to Ricoeur,

“This narrative interpretation implies that a life story proceeds from untold and repressed stories in the direction of actual stories the subject can take and tell as constitutive of his identity. It is the quest for this personal identity that assures the continuity between the potential or inchoate story and the actual story we assume responsibility for(Olson 1985)”

Narrative in Modern World

In today’s world, a narrative contributes in many ways to obtaining different educational and otherwise objectives. Media enables people to express their stories, cultural values, and their knowledge to the world. Moreover, on television, many documentaries adopt the narrative technique to communicate. Furthermore, the narrative is verbally expressed expressions of associated occasions in which an agent speaks to a specific circumstance or cycle in a manner to mirror an all-encompassing arrangement of points or qualities. A narrative can be traded or can be supplanted by another narrative, where there is a narrative there should be another or elective narrative. Each narrative declares a ghost of the real world and spikes and urges individuals to trust it frantically and indiscriminately and they acknowledge it uncritically. The mimetic part of the narrative pushes for impersonation while the engaging element of narrative energizes a cycle of discussion, comprehension, and challenge. On the off chance that one exists, the other narrative continues, the taint obstruction narrative has assumed the significant job (Eerten et al. 2017)

In the modern-day world, narratives are used for a broader function. Especially in the last century the meaning of narratives is used for a few other meanings, using for explanation or own welfare irrespective of humanity. Hitler used his power for the formation of the idea of being a superior nation, power always exploits narratives. These days the word narrative has increased with the increase of education sometimes it is used for self-centered purposes by power in the form of textbooks. Another reason for the increased significance of the word narrative is that people think logically and rationally. Today we see that narrative serves as a way to communicate, writers, cultural, moral, and political perspectives. We are living in the modern world where the world become a global village, people are social beings and influence each other. They become more extreme in their attitudes and views. In the modern world, we hear narratives, talk narratives, perused and banter narratives, and love and disdain narratives(Khushf 1997). The word narrative increased its importance in the late 20th century and the 21st century, we can say that this is the age of narrative. In this century there are new methods to occupy territory and influence others as is the age of controlling thoughts and minds. As narrative offers something that is narrated i-e written or told but this term has gotten more famous in the most recent couple of years. “A Narrative can be replaced by another resistance or alternative narrative, where there is a narrative, there is or must be another(Stanley 2016). Most powers are involved in creating a narrative in society in the modern world that spreads through speeches, talks, and texts. Power is inherent in human beings and human being uses these powers in creating narratives it is such a powerful tool that one can rule the whole world without using any weapon (Mouritsen, Larsen, and Bukh 2001).

According to MAJ Gittipong Paruchabutr,

“Narrative exerts a powerful full influence on human thought and behavior. They consolidate memory, shape emotions, cue heuristics, and biases in judgment, influence in-group/out-group distinctions, and may affect the fundamental contents of personal identity (Paruchabutr 2012)”

In the present world, a lot of techniques have been designed to control individuals' brains (Ryan 2007). Not all narratives do not have to be always true but there must be fictional elements and they can be fabricated. Now the narrative is affected by the political, social, and historical conditions of any country. Now a day narratives are also used to convey messages about cooperation, social bonding, friendship, and sex equally as well (McEwan 1997). The narrative does not just matter for large groups it is also important at the individual level (Wertsch 1997). Traditional narratives were firmly established, these were master narratives that contained within the other, subsidiary stories that centered on more transient matters (McAdams 2006). Master narratives broke up in today's world because people migrate and religions unknit under the attack of rational education. Master narratives became stories of the past and were not able to guide forces that resolute both morality and reality. We need to be part of a narrative no matter how manipulative or simplistic it is (McAdams 2006).

Hate Narrative and their Kinds

As per an examination, 10 and 20% of all disdain violations are propelled by a religious inclination. They utilize the information revealed by Uniform Crime Report (UCR) and the National Crime Victimization Survey (NCVS) to evaluate religion-related wrongdoing. The investigation reports a descending pattern in this rate as indicated by the information given by UCR while an NCVS report demonstrated a moderately steady rate in both number and extent (Scheitle and Hansmann 2016). The sorts of hate narratives concentrated in Pākistān depict the fierce fanatic associations, including al-Qaeda which has been misused to elevate them and to pick up compassion utilizing religion. Fanatic vital correspondence endeavors prompt the battle against Islam. Therefore, the narratives advanced by radicals are gaining solid ground among the individuals of Pākistān, who are logically considering fanatics to be an appealing method of portraying their general surroundings (Scheitle and Hansmann 2016, Khan 2013). Online conversation about religion is another dimension of hate narratives that has a reflection of religious confusion, with misguided intentions (Kursuncu et al. 2019). Thousands of Islamic extremists use such material, which is shattering peaceful Muslims. However, their efforts proved ineffective most of the time. Most of the time, Twitter was used as the main source to spread hate against religion (Shibly, Sharma, and Naleer 2021). Freedom of speech on social media, enables anti-social behavior online harassment, cyberbullying, and hate narratives. Two sorts of hate narratives via online media were distinguished by performing a phonetic and psycholinguistic investigation of these two types of hate narratives (ElSherief et al. 2018). Another study explained the difference between freedom of speech and freedom of hate speech. They perform their analysis using a social media site that has a very loose policy for moderation. They analyze that hate speeches were increasing and new users are becoming hateful at an increasing and faster rate (Mathew et al. 2020).

Examples of Hate Narratives in Pakistan

In Pākistān the use of narrative was introduced by the government of Pervez Musharraf to counter the wave of terrorism. First of all General Žiā introduced the slogan “first of all we are Muslim than Pākistānis”. This slogan had badly impacted non-Muslim citizens of Pākistān and made them feel like second-class citizens of the country. Another narrative was initiated about Afghan Jihad. This movement was started with the collaboration of the US, CIA, and Arab countries. Another narrative was created in the time of Benazir Bhutto that was afghan Pākistān

boundaries vanished and a large number of Mujāhadiyn entered Afghanistan to take place in jihad (Saeed 2018). Extremism is the state of being extreme, it is sometimes violent and sometimes non-violent. Some main points of narrative propagated by different terrorist groups and parties in Pākistān and all over the world like

- Implementation of Islamic shari'ahh in Pākistān
- The Pākistāni state is un-Islamic
- Shias are not Muslim
- The Pākistāni government is guided by the US and apostate
- Every Pākistāni are non-believer and infidel
- In tribal areas, people are oppressed and ill-treated by the Pākistāni army in the name of war
- Pākistāni leaders are western agents
- The media is misleading the public and also the gadget of Dajāl
- Muslims are terrorist
- Muslims are extremists
- Muslims are against Jews
- Muslim hats Non-Muslims
- Killing in the name of Blasphemy (Mohmand 2020).

Means and Methods to develop an effective Narrative

There are different means and methods by which these narratives increased importance among people all over the world. These means are used in a wide variety of ways to spread or consume narratives. First of all, we are talking about social media as a tool and platform for such activities.

Social Media

Social media is a platform for communicating with people and this is the social interaction among individuals in this interaction individuals share, make and trade thoughts and data (Hayes, Wesselmann, and Carr 2018). Social media includes a wide variety of ways to create different narratives through text messages, pictures, photos, audio, and videos. A truly outstanding element of social media is that they are economical to utilize and simple to overabundance and have a quick progression of data. It is including conventional media additionally, for example, newspapers and TV. This is the route through which the connection can be made with both limited and tolerant crowd permitting tow-way, one-to-many, numerous to numerous correspondence, from client to client, client to crowd, the crowd to the client, or crowd to crowd (van Eerten et al. 2017).

Social media and mobile technology have also enabled extremist groups to project their narratives more widely. Extremists have their channels on Youtube and they upload videos accordingly. These videos are deliberately scripted, maybe the most celebrated illustration of the utilization of You tube by ISI in their arrangement of recordings of rough executions (Eerten et al. 2017). Twitter has gotten one of the favored social media Platforms for vicious fanatic associations and their stories are about war zone triumphs, gore, and viciousness. The Youtube,

remark segment empowers brutal radical substances rapidly to one another. Twitter is contributing to a blog administration with 328 million dynamic clients. Twitter has gotten one of the favored social media Platforms for the savage radical association. Online social systems administration furnishes fear mongers with an ideal stage to draw in, educate and radicalize everywhere in the world (LE SC UREU).

Political and religious leaders

Media is the main source of communication between politicians and polity, between civilians and their leaders. This is the age when people have become more aware of the power of narratives. Politicians communicate with common people and the government and then shares their political ideas through talk shows, entertainment programs, and films. Media also provides a public space for discussion. Through media-political leaders play a role in structuring different narratives. Media is the way of interaction between the public and their leaders. Different events are simplified and structured as a political narrative, politicians bring several influences through this platform by affecting the public. In this era of digital communication political narratives are built face to face communication, books, films to social media (Page 2009). Different slogans are raised as a narrative and while creating the narrative for the future, the political leaders make selective use of history to justify their notions. They pick up statements of historical leaders for justifying what they want to achieve and in this way they make the public believe their narrative. Some of the leading narratives over the years have been:

1. The original Grand Narrative
2. The regionalist scenario
3. The Islamist vision
4. The Jihādi Pākistān
5. Islamic-sectarian
6. New Pākistān
7. Jinnāh's Pākistān (Langland 2012)

Religious leaders have become dominant, famous, and influential in many Muslim countries. For religious narrative religious Television and different programs on TV and social media are used. Different madāras and mosques are also used by these religious leaders to promote effective narratives. These narratives are spread to gather public support on religious issues. Religious leaders are in a position to use their religion from different aspects by giving the audience a narrative. They are at the center of peace and conflict and they are closer to the people and they fully understand how religious identities are created among the public (Smock 2006).

Social and civil society activists

Civil activists are playing multiple roles in creating different narratives. A large number of civil activists and Organizations have been active in countering extremism from one another (Mirahmadi, Farooq, and Ziad 2012) These actors from common society can assume various parts in countering negative considerations. Business leaders can assume their functions by putting resources into harmony programs. Each mother can participate in

the lives of radical youth. Activists can advance city habitats and projects that emphasize tending to the strict measurement or savage radicals by giving them a positive idea (Johnston et al. 2016).

Education

Extremism and intolerance affect the educational system whether it is religious education or modern education. Our highly educated youth are used by terrorists for their hateful and wicked crimes. Education is the main source for creating an effective narrative among the public and especially youth against extremism, radicalization, and sectarianism. Colleges, universities, and religious seminaries should have devised effective curricula against hate narratives. It will help to stop all kinds of mess in the minds of the youth. Co-curricular activities and calm behavior of students about a student, politics could take students toward positive use of their energies (Abdullah and Saeed 2016). The aim of education should be to create tolerance and students should be able to acquire and critically think about any issue and reject conspiracy and false information. Well-respected scholars should be consulted to design a curriculum and remove negativity from books. Lessons on tolerance and peace need to be part of the curriculum (Curtis 2007).

Developing a counter-narrative

Counter Narrative is the answer that goes against the existing narrative. Countering hate narratives means exploring ways to counter hate speech by replacing them with such ideas that promote peace (Sajjad 2015). The counter-narrative is a method that gives a positive alternative to any extremist narrative or propaganda or pushes back by demystifying it through a positive narrative (Zehr 2015). Alternative narratives give the solution to counter hate speech by using different forms of dialogue. An alternative narrative is a term that is used to shut all types of activities that challenge extremist propaganda in different types (Adame and Knudson 2007).

Countering narrative in Pākistān

The last few decades of Pākistān's history were the years when things have become worse due to some factors. That was the years of radicalization, extremism, and terrorism, hatred for minorities. In this situation, it was important to counter hate speech through counter-narrative. This requires a clear understanding of the central features of an extremist narrative, developing an outline for counter-narrative, and most important which institutions can play a constructive role in challenging the narrative (Rubinson 2003). The government of Pākistān has implemented different reforms and policies in education, curriculum, economic development, media, and security areas to address the danger of radicalism. Different examples from the time of President Musharraf can be seen and Pākistāni civil society has played a major role in Counter Violent extremists programs and different other programs for peacebuilding through different channels. CSOs organized in 2009 in Lahore to organize the Istihqām-i-Pākistān conference. Secondly, a few community leaders and public intellectuals are promoting peace, for example, Syed Ali 'abbās Zayidi through his painting. Another step for countering extremism was a radio station that has been established and a radio program The Dawn and the Voice of Peace succeeded with the help of the international community (Cherney and Belton 2021). Thirdly Jinnah Institute conducts research and public awareness campaigns like National Flag Day March. The fourth example was faith-based organizations and cultural associations that condemn the destruction of Pākistān and its cultural heritage and innocent civilians.

There is an example of a church that was targeted by extremists in Peshawar (Aly, Balbi, and Jacques 2015). Fifth, several efforts to promote diversity and tolerance from the grassroots level in Peshawar by Bushra Haider the director of Qadims Lumier School and college through a peace education curriculum. The sixth example of a counter-narrative is Baanhn Beli from rural Sindh. They are busy working to build interfaith relations between the Hindu and Muslim communities. Another example of countering extremism was different seminars on Qu'ranic principles of peace organized by Dārul-'uloomāshraf al-Mādaris Okara. For this cause, different scholars have issued anti-terror fatwas. For example, Dr. Tahirul-Qadri issued his 600 pages fatwa against suicide bombing and terrorism has become a powerful gadget to other Pākistāni scholars. Another example of peacebuilding by women in KPK province under the organization PIAMAN teaches reconciliation and different skills to youth and women for conflict transformation through the "Let's Live in Peace Project" (Mora 2014) Operation Zarb-i-āzb was started to counter religious extremism in Pākistān because it is the power of the militants to use the religion-based popular narratives for their advantage (Milner IV and Howard 2013) Religion and nationalism were mixed up right from their creation and used for different degrees by administrations in Pākistān. The ruling elite in Pākistān used their will in the form of a mixture of religion-ism, secularism, and nationalism to achieve their political objectives. This use of religion though never resulted in religious extremism but it made religion an important element of national and political narrative (Habib 2018).

Paighām-e-pākistān: counter-narrative to end extremism

An example of a counter-narrative against terrorism and extremism is the Paighām-e-Pākistān. It is called a national narrative issued by all religious scholars from all schools of thought, Muftis with the help of the Islamic Research Institute (IRI) of International university Islāmabad at Aiwān-e-SadarIslāmabad on Tuesday, January 16, 2018 (Carthy and Sarma 2021). The paighām-e- Pākistān narrative talks about national integration which would achieve through the unity of the whole nation, through national cohesion, strength, and stability(Jacobson 2009). It was announced at Aiwān-e-Sadar in a ceremony chaired by the President of Pākistān. It was prepared with the help of eminent 'ulamā of Pākistān from all schools of thought and has been ratified by over 5000 Pākistāni'ulamā, scholars, political leaders and other leading members of civil society. It was endorsed by several internationally renowned religious authorities(Hussain and Zia-ul-Haq 2019). In this Fatwa, all religious scholars condemn terrorism and extremism. According to the religious decree, Jihād is being the purview of the state. It is also said that the soil of the Islamic Republic of Pākistān should not be used by any group for promoting extremism and terrorism and is not allowed by anyone. It is also offered that protection to the property and life of non-Muslims. The declaration said that tolerance and promotion of justice should promote in the state. The declaration said that all kinds of sabotage or acts of terrorism that exploit regional, religious, linguistic, and sectarian differences are against shari'ah and Islām. It is also said that the use of force in the name of enforcing shari'ah should not be allowed. No individual or any group had the right law into its hands and it is also prohibited to set up a parallel court system. And imposing one's ideology on others or imposing one's views on others was against Islamic teachings. All mufti sā'ibān and Islamic scholars declared that armed mutiny or insurgence against the state, suicide attacks, and enforcing shari'ah by the use of force was forbidden and Harām and this announcement was called "Paighām-e- Pākistān, (Message of Pākistān). It is the second biggest and most historic consensus among all the sects after the 1973 constitutions (Al Raffie 2012).

A national counter-terrorism narrative would help to wipe out terrorism and guide the people who are lost in negative thoughts. This is a step in the right direction and the effort of all religious scholars and Muftis reiterates that Pākistān was an Islamic state believing in injustice, love, peace, and tolerance. The national narrative about countering-narrative shows that the whole nation was quite serious about the issues of terrorism. Through unity, they would be successful in achieving their objectives. With this positive narrative, it is clear to the entire world that we are united against terrorism, and the outcomes of this narrative will be obvious very soon (Tuck and Silverman 2016).

Conclusion

In the modern-day world, one cannot deny the significance of narratives and various ways to counter them. Various hate narratives had very long-lasting effects, outcomes, and impacts. Unfortunately, Pakistani society has seen many such hate speeches. Various elements were actively involved in promoting these hate speeches. There were no effective counter-narratives for such hate speeches. Various examples of violent extremism were the outcomes of such hate narratives. On the other hand, Paighām-e-Pākistān is hope and light in the dark and this narrative will likely play its role in the long run.

References

- Abdullah, Nauman A, and Muhammad Saeed. 2016. "Extremism in education in Pakistan: University teachers' thoughts." *Ankara University Journal of Faculty of Educational Sciences (JFES)* no. 49 (2):55-70.
- Adame, Alexandra L, and Roger M Knudson. 2007. "Beyond the counter-narrative: Exploring alternative narratives of recovery from the psychiatric survivor movement." *Narrative Inquiry* no. 17 (2):157-178.
- Al Raffie, Dina. 2012. "Whose hearts and minds? Narratives and counter-narratives of Salafi Jihadism." *Journal of Terrorism Research*.
- Aly, Anne, Anne-Marie Balbi, and Carmen Jacques. 2015. "Rethinking countering violent extremism: implementing the role of civil society." *Journal of Policing, Intelligence and Counter Terrorism* no. 10 (1):3-13.
- Carthy, SL, and KM Sarma. 2021. "Countering Terrorist Narratives: Assessing the Efficacy and Mechanisms of Change in Counter-narrative Strategies." *Terrorism and Political Violence*:1-25.
- Cherney, Adrian, and Emma Belton. 2021. "Evaluating case-managed approaches to counter radicalization and violent extremism: An example of the Proactive Integrated Support Model (PRISM) intervention." *Studies in Conflict & Terrorism* no. 44 (8):625-645.
- Curtis, Lisa A. 2007. *US aid to Pakistan: Countering extremism through education reform*: Heritage Foundation Washington DC.
- Eerten, J-J van, Bertjan Doosje, Elly Konijn, B de Graaf, and M de Goede. 2017. "Developing a social media response to radicalization."
- ElSherief, Mai, Vivek Kulkarni, Dana Nguyen, William Yang Wang, and Elizabeth Belding. 2018. *Hate lingo: A target-based linguistic analysis of hate speech in social media*. Paper read at Proceedings of the International AAAI Conference on Web and Social Media.
- Habib, Anwar. 2018. *Counter narrative: the missing link in Pakistan's counter-terrorism strategy*. US Army School for Advanced Military Studies Fort Leavenworth United States.

- Hayes, Rebecca A, Eric D Wesselmann, and Caleb T Carr. 2018. "When nobody "likes" you: Perceived ostracism through paralinguistic digital affordances within social media." *Social Media+ Society* no. 4 (3):2056305118800309.
- Hussain, Mamnoon, and Muhammad Zia-ul-Haq. 2019. "Paigham-e-Pakistan (The Message of Pakistan)[II] National Narrative Counter to Violence, Extremism, and Terrorism in an Islamic Perspective."
- Jacobson, Michael. 2009. "Terrorist drop-outs: One way of promoting a counter-narrative." *Perspectives on terrorism* no. 3 (2):12-17.
- Johnston, Douglas, Andrew McDonnell, Henry Burbridge, and James Patton. 2016. "Countering violent religious extremism in Pakistan." White Paper, March. International Center for Religion and Diplomacy. <https://icrd.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/12/Countering-Violent-Religious-Extremism-in-Pakistan-White-Paper.pdf> (accessed March 28, 2020).
- Khan, Amil. 2013. *Pakistan and the Narratives of Extremism*: United States Institute of Peace.
- Khushf, George. 1997. "James Fodor," *Christian Hermeneutics: Paul Ricoeur and the Refiguring of Theology*(Book Review)." *International Journal for the Philosophy of Religion* no. 41 (2):126-128.
- Kursuncu, Ugur, Manas Gaur, Carlos Castillo, Amanuel Alambo, Krishnaprasad Thirunarayan, Valerie Shalin, Dilshod Achilov, I Budak Arpinar, and Amit Sheth. 2019. "Modeling Islamist extremist communications on social media using contextual dimensions: religion, ideology, and hate." *Proceedings of the ACM on Human-Computer Interaction* no. 3 (CSCW):1-22.
- Langland, Elizabeth. 2012. Cultural narratives of academic leadership at the dawn of the 21st century. Paper read at Forum on Public Policy: A Journal of the Oxford Round Table.
- LE SC UREU, X. "Human Dimensions of Wild Equid Management: Exploring the Meanings of" Wild."
- Lehtinen, Mikaela. 2020. "Celebrating change resistance: Change resistance-a threat or an opportunity?"
- Leuprecht, Christian, Todd Hataley, Sophia Moskalenko, and Clark McCauley. 2010. "Containing the narrative: Strategy and tactics in countering the storyline of global jihad." *Journal of Policing, Intelligence and Counter Terrorism* no. 5 (1):42-57.
- Mathew, Binny, Anurag Illendula, Punyajoy Saha, Soumya Sarkar, Pawan Goyal, and Animesh Mukherjee. 2020. "Hate begets hate: A temporal study of hate speech." *Proceedings of the ACM on Human-Computer Interaction* no. 4 (CSCW2):1-24.
- McAdams, Dan P. 2006. "The role of narrative in personality psychology today." *Narrative inquiry* no. 16 (1):11-18.
- McEwan, Hunter. 1997. "The functions of narrative and research on teaching." *Teaching and Teacher Education* no. 13 (1):85-92.
- Milner IV, H Richard, and Tyrone C Howard. 2013. "Counter-narrative as method: Race, policy, and research for teacher education." *Race Ethnicity and Education* no. 16 (4):536-561.
- Mirahmadi, Hedieh, Mehreen Farooq, and Waleed Ziad. 2012. *Pakistan's civil society: Alternative channels to countering violent extremism: WORDE*.
- Mohmand, Said Nazeer. 2020. "New Stratagems in the Strategic Arena and Pakistan." *Policy Perspectives* no. 17 (1):171-176.
- Mora, Raul Alberto. 2014. "Counter-narrative." *Qualitative inquiry* no. 8 (1):23-44.
- Mouritsen, Jan, Heine T Larsen, and Per ND Bukh. 2001. "Intellectual capital and the 'capable firm': narrating, visualizing and numbering for managing knowledge." *Accounting, organizations and society* no. 26 (7-8):735-762.
- Olson, AM. 1985. "P. Ricoeur," *Time and narrative*(Book Review)." *International Journal for the Philosophy of Religion* no. 18 (3):180.
- Page, Ruth. 2009. *New perspectives on narrative and multimodality*. Vol. 1: Routledge.

- Paruchabutr, Gittipong. 2012. Understanding and communicating through narratives. ARMY COMMAND AND GENERAL STAFF COLL FORT LEAVENWORTH KS SCHOOL OF ADVANCED
- Rubinson, Robert. 2003. "Client Counseling, Mediation, and Alternative Narratives of Dispute Resolution." *Clinical L. Rev.* no. 10:833.
- Ryan, Marie-Laure. 2007. "Toward a definition of narrative." *The Cambridge companion to narrative* no. 22.
- Saeed, Riaz Ahmad. 2018. "Contemporary Challenges regarding Muslim-Christian Dialogue: And Its Solution in the Light of Nobel Sīrah of the Holy Prophet." *AL-ILM-Journal* no. 2 (2).
- Sajjad, Fatima. 2015. "Countering extremists' narrative in Pakistan." *NDU Journal*, 24 (4):76-79.
- Scheitle, Christopher P, and Michelle Hansmann. 2016. "Religion-related hate crimes: data, trends, and limitations." *Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion* no. 55 (4):859-873.
- Shibly, FHA, Uzzal Sharma, and HMM Naleer. 2021. Classifying and measuring hate speech on Twitter using topic classifier of sentiment analysis. Paper read at International Conference on Innovative Computing and Communications.
- Smock, David R. 2006. Religious contributions to peacemaking: When religion brings peace, not war: US Institute of Peace.
- Stanley, Liz. 2016. Documents of life revisited: Narrative and biographical methodology for a 21st-century critical humanism: Routledge.
- Tuck, Henry, and Tanya Silverman. 2016. "The counter-narrative handbook." Institute for Strategic Dialogue:1.
- van Eerten, Jan-Jaap, Bertjan Doosje, Elly Konijn, Beatrice de Graaf, and Marielle de Goede. 2017. "Developing a Social Media Response to Radicalization." University of Amsterdam:42-57.
- Wertsch, James V. 1997. Narrative tools of history and identity. Sage Publications Sage CA: Thousand Oaks, CA.
- Zehr, Nahed Artoul. 2015. "Introduction: A Symposium on Peace, Islam, and Counter-Narratives." *Soundings: An Interdisciplinary Journal* no. 98 (4):429-439.